



# Staff Report to Council - for Direction

**Title:** Durham Street Bridge MCEA -Preferred Alternative Endorsement

**From:** Adam Stanley, Director of Transportation and Environmental Services

**Date:** August 1, 2024

---

## Staff Recommendation:

That the Draft Environmental Study Report (ESR) for the ongoing Municipal Class Environmental Assessment of the Durham Street Bridge in Walkerton be received; and,

That Alternative 2, the Bridge Repair/Rehabilitation option, be endorsed as the preferred alternative.

## Report Summary:

In 2021 a Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (MCEA) was initiated by the County to consider options associated with the future of the Durham Street Bridge, which spans the Saugeen River in the community of Walkerton, Ontario. A Draft Environmental Study Report (ESR) has been produced to provide documentation of the decision-making process followed by the County through the MCEA process. After a considerable amount of public consultation, Staff are recommending that Council receive the Draft ESR and endorse alternative 2, the Bridge Repair/Rehabilitation option, as the preferred alternative. Upon endorsement, the ESR will be finalized and made available to the public and review agencies for a period of 30 calendar days. Subject to the report being finalized, the tendering process will commence in early Fall of 2024 and construction is anticipated to be completed in 2025.

## Background:

In 2021 a Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (MCEA) was initiated by the County to consider options associated with the future of the Durham Street Bridge, which spans the Saugeen River in the community of Walkerton, Ontario. The County's consultant, BM Ross & Associates, conducted a background review to obtain a general characterization of the project area and to identify factors that could influence the selection of alternative solutions to the defined problem.

In the Fall of 2022, the initial public information centre (PIC) was held to discuss proposed alternatives in accordance with the MCEA process. A subsequent PIC meeting was held in May of 2023 with the affected downtown business owners. The preferred alternative at that time, involved a costly full replacement of the bridge, a 7.0km detour and a construction period of 2+ years. Residents, members of the public and business owners expressed a

significant amount of concern regarding the preferred alternative being considered. There was a petition submitted to the Municipality of Brockton and subsequently the County, calling for a re-evaluation of the preferred alternative.

In July of 2023, the County retained Triton Engineering Services to complete a Third-Party Review of various components of the MCEA process being conducted for the Durham Street Bridge. This included potential bridge replacement alternatives, detour alternatives and reinforcement measures designed to address deficiencies associated with the half-joints.

To assist with the review, the services of the HAL Group Inc. were retained to complete an updated detailed Bridge Condition Survey (BCS), which was completed in October of 2023. The results of the updated BCS were presented to staff in January of 2024.

On March 7, 2024 a report was presented to Bruce County Council summarizing the results of the Third Party Review completed by Triton Engineering Services. The following recommendations were included in the report:

- 1) That bridge rehabilitation be re-introduced into the MCEA process as a viable alternative for evaluation, in addition to the original bridge replacement option.
- 2) That the County procure the services of an Investigate-Design-Build (IDB) Contractor to complete the repairs of the bridge's half-joints and accompanied bridge elements (Immediate Bridge Repairs) in 2024 in order to maintain safe passage over the bridge while the MCEA process is ongoing.

On April 4, 2024 Council authorized Staff to defer the Bruce Road 19 project and transfer funds from that project and Bridge reserve to allow for Structural Technologies to proceed with immediate repairs of the Durham Street bridge's half-joints.

On May 1, 2024 the final PIC was held to address the ongoing MCEA. The updated alternatives being considered for the MCEA are as follows:

**Alternative 1** - Replacement of the Existing Bridge. This alternative would involve the removal of the existing structure and its replacement with a new bridge in the same general location in order to connect to the existing County road network.

**Alternative 2** - Repair/Rehabilitation of the Existing Bridge. This option would involve a series of repairs to the existing bridge which, when completed, would remediate the structural deterioration identified by recent engineering inspections.

**Alternative 3** - Do Nothing. This option proposes that no improvements or changes be made to address the identified problem. The result could be eventual structural failure of the bridge. During the MCEA planning and design process, the "Do Nothing" alternative may be implemented at any time prior to the commencement of construction. A decision to "Do Nothing" would typically be made when the costs of all other alternatives, both financial and environmental, significantly outweigh the benefits.

A Draft Environmental Study Report (ESR) has been produced to provide documentation of the decision-making process followed by the County through the MCEA process. After a

considerable amount of public consultation, staff are recommending that Council receive the Draft ESR and endorse alternative 2, the Bridge Repair/Rehabilitation option, as the preferred alternative.

The works associated with Alternative 2 outlined in section 3.4 of the ESR will be constructed during the 2024/25 construction season, pending the successful completion of the MCEA process and the receipt of approvals. The emergency reinforcement component of the project was initiated in May 2024 and will be completed in December of 2024. The rehabilitation work required to address deterioration present in the rest of the structure would be initiated in early 2025 and be completed by year's end.

The probable cost of the capital works project is approximately \$5,900,000. This includes the ongoing immediate repairs of the half-joints as well as the additional rehabilitation needed to address deterioration present in the remainder of the structure. This estimate does not include the Contract Administration and Engineering/approvals portion of the project.

Representatives from BM Ross will be in attendance at the August 1<sup>st</sup>, 2024 County Council meeting to present the MCEA documents. Representatives from Triton Engineering are also available for any questions related to the ongoing immediate half-joint repairs and proposed rehabilitation works.

#### **Financial/Staffing/Legal/IT Considerations:**

There are no Financial, Staffing, Legal or IT considerations in regard to this recommendation for the 2024 budget year. The project budget for the Bridge Repair and Rehabilitation option will be presented to council with the 2025 capital budget considerations.

#### **Interdepartmental Consultation:**

The Office of the CAO was consulted on this report.

#### **Link to Strategic Goals and Objectives:**

Community and Partnerships - Enhance and grow partnerships

Growth and Innovation - Strengthen County's use of technology and innovative initiatives

#### **Link to Departmental Plan Goals and Objectives, if any:**

Advancement - Goal No. 5 from the Transportation & Environmental Services Departmental 2024 Business Plan - Re-enforcement of the Durham Street Bridge.

#### **Report Author:**

Ryan Errington, Engineering Manager

**Departmental Approval:**

Adam Stanley, Director of Transportation and Environmental Services

**Approved for Submission:**

Claire Dodds, Commissioner of Community Development